

1 California Evidence (5th), Circumstantial Evidence

I. IN GENERAL

A. [§1] Distinction Between Direct and Circumstantial Evidence.

B. [§2] Testimony as Circumstantial Evidence.

II. RELEVANCY AND MATERIALITY

A. Definitions and Distinctions.

1. [§3] Materiality.

2. [§4] Relevancy.

B. Admissibility and Exclusionary Rules.

1. In General.

(a) [§5] Admissibility of Relevant Evidence.

(b) [§6] Exclusion of Irrelevant Evidence.

(c) [§7] Exclusion of Relevant Evidence Under Exclusionary Rules.

(d) Exclusion of Relevant Evidence for Policy Reasons.

(1) [§8] In General.

(2) [§9] Miscellaneous Exclusionary Rules.

2. Evidence on Uncontested Issue.

(a) [§10] General Rule of Exclusion.

(b) Exceptions and Distinctions.

(1) [§11] Factual Description of Injury.

(2) [§12] Defective Admission or Stipulation.

(3) [§13] Evidence Relevant on Distinct Issue.

(4) [§14] Prosecution's Evidence on Element of Crime.

(c) Stipulation on Prior Conviction.

(1) [§15] Former Rule.

(2) [§16] Effect of Proposition 8.

3. Discretionary Exclusion Under Ev.C. 352.

(a) [§17] Statutory Balancing Test.

(b) [§18] Power Confirmed by Proposition 8.

(c) [§19] Exercise of Discretion Is Encouraged.

(d) [§20] Procedure.

(e) Particular Grounds.

(1) [§21] Evidence Prejudicial to Prosecution.

(2) [§22] Evidence Prejudicial Only to Codefendant.

(3) [§23] Confusion of Issues and Misleading Jury.

(4) [§24] Undue Consumption of Time.

(5) [§25] Distinction: Unfair Surprise.

C. Test of Relevancy.

1. [§26] General Principles.

2. [§27] Civil Cases.

3. Criminal Cases.

(a) [§28] Homicide.

(b) [§29] Other Offenses.

(c) [§30] Distinction: Profile Evidence.

4. [§31] Negative Evidence.

D. Limited Admissibility.

1. In General.
 - (a) [§32] Nature of Doctrine.
 - (b) [§33] Procedural Rules.
 - (c) [§34] Doctrine in Bifurcated Trial.
 - (d) [§35] Deletion of Inadmissible Matter.
2. Illustrations.
 - (a) [§36] Civil Cases.
 - (b) [§37] Criminal Cases.

E. Entire Act To Explain Part.

1. [§38] Rule and Theory.
2. [§39] Limitation: Matters Related to Part.

III. PARTICULAR KINDS OF CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE

A. Character.

1. Nature and Distinctions.
 - (a) [§40] Moral Character.
 - (b) Character for Care or Skill Is Inadmissible.
 - (1) [§41] Exclusionary Rule.
 - (2) [§42] Other Accidents of Driver.
 - (3) [§43] Habit Distinguished.
 - (c) [§44] Character To Prove Conduct Is Inadmissible.
2. Methods of Proof.
 - (a) [§45] In General.
 - (b) [§46] Reputation.
3. Proof of Character in Civil Cases.
 - (a) In General.
 - (1) [§47] Character in Issue.
 - (2) [§48] Manner of Proof.
 - (b) Action for Sexual Assault or Harassment.
 - (1) [§49] Nature and Purpose of Statutes.
 - (2) [§50] Limited Admissibility of Evidence.
 - (3) [§51] Manner of Proof.
4. Proof of Character in Criminal Cases.
 - (a) Character of Defendant.
 - (1) Admissibility.
 - (aa) [§52] Bad Character Is Initially Excluded.
 - (bb) [§53] Good Character Is Admissible.
 - (cc) [§54] Bad Character in Rebuttal.
 - (dd) [§55] Character for Violence.
 - (2) Manner of Proof.
 - (aa) [§56] Reputation.
 - (bb) [§57] Opinions.
 - (cc) [§58] Specific Acts.
 - (dd) [§58A] (New) Possession of Condoms.
 - (b) Character of Victim.
 - (1) [§59] Admissibility.

- (2) Manner of Proof.
 - (aa) [§60] Reputation and Opinions.
 - (bb) [§61] Specific Acts.
- (c) [§62] Character of Victim's Associates.
- (d) Character of Victim in Sex Case.
 - (1) [§63] Former Law and Statutory Revision.
 - (2) [§64] Manner of Proof.
 - (3) [§65] Restrictions on Admissibility.
 - (4) [§66] Illustrations.
 - (5) [§67] Instructions.
 - (6) [§68] Federal Rules of Evidence.
- (e) [§68A] (New) Character of Human Trafficking Victim.

B. Habit or Custom of Party.

- 1. Admissibility To Prove Conduct.
 - (a) [§69] General Rule.
 - (b) [§70] Doing of Act.
 - (c) Due Care or Negligence.
 - (1) [§71] Due Care.
 - (2) [§72] Negligence.
 - (3) [§73] Abrogation of Eyewitness Limitation.
- 2. [§74] Manner of Proof.
- 3. [§75] Habit or Custom Is Inadmissible in Products Liability Case.

C. Similar or Related Acts or Circumstances.

- 1. Criminal Case: Other Offenses of Defendant.
 - (a) [§76] General Rule of Exclusion.
 - (b) Exceptions Applicable and Other Offenses Admissible.
 - (1) [§77] Theory of Limited Admissibility.
 - (2) [§78] Subsequent Offenses.
 - (3) [§79] Remoteness of Prior Offense.
 - (4) [§80] Defendant Not Prosecuted or Convicted.
 - (5) [§81] Constitutionally Invalid Confession.
 - (6) [§82] Procedure.
 - (c) Exceptions Inapplicable and Other Offenses Inadmissible.
 - (1) Issue Uncontested.
 - (aa) [§83] General Rule.
 - (bb) [§84] Where Issue Is Part of Prosecution's Burden.
 - (2) [§85] Offenses Not Connected.
 - (3) [§86] Unsupported Assertion of Admissible Purpose.
 - (4) [§87] Inadmissible To Support Prosecution Witness.
 - (5) [§88] Discretionary Exclusion.
 - (d) [§89] Required Degree of Similarity.
 - (e) Illustrations of Admissible Evidence.
 - (1) Intent, Motive, and Knowledge.
 - (aa) [§90] In General.
 - (bb) [§91] Criminal Intent.
 - (cc) [§92] Knowledge.

- (dd) [§93] Motive.
- (2) Common Scheme or Plan.
 - (aa) [§94] In General.
 - (bb) [§95] Interconnected Offenses.
 - (cc) [§96] Marks Distinctive: Evidence Admissible.
 - (dd) [§97] Marks Not Distinctive: Evidence Inadmissible.
- (f) Admissibility in Sex Crime Cases.
 - (1) [§98] In General.
 - (2) [§99] Evidence Code.
 - (3) [§100] Constitutionality.
- (g) Admissibility in Domestic Violence, Elder Abuse, and Child Abuse Cases.
 - (1) [§101] In General.
 - (2) [§102] Illustrative Cases.
- (h) [§103] Procedural Evasions of Exclusionary Rule.
- 2. [§104] Criminal Cases: Offenses of Third Parties.
- 3. [§105] Civil Case: Other Wrongful Acts.
- 4. Other Accidents at Same or Similar Place.
 - (a) [§106] Rule and Purpose of Admission.
 - (b) [§107] Illustrations.
 - (c) [§108] Similarity of Conditions.
 - (d) [§109] Subsequent Accidents.
 - (e) [§110] Absence of Similar Accidents.
- 5. Prior and Subsequent Conditions or Acts.
 - (a) [§111] General Principle.
 - (b) [§112] Subsequent Conditions.
 - (c) [§113] Prior or Subsequent Acts.
- 6. Custom or Practice of Others on Negligence Issue.
 - (a) [§114] Admissibility and Effect.
 - (b) [§115] Custom Differing From Statutory Standard.
- 7. [§116] Contracts of Others.
- 8. [§117] Experience of Others.
- 9. Other Sales To Prove Value.
 - (a) [§118] Sales of Similar Personal Property.
 - (b) [§119] Sales of Same Real or Personal Property.
 - (c) [§120] Sales of Other Real Property.

D. Intent of Party.

- 1. [§121] Criminal Cases.
- 2. [§122] Civil Cases.

E. Motive.

- 1. Criminal Cases.
 - (a) Motive of Defendant.
 - (1) [§123] In General.
 - (2) [§124] Need To Obtain Money.
 - (3) [§125] Use of Narcotics.
 - (b) Motive of Third Person.

- (1) [§126] In General.
- (2) [§127] Illustrations.

2. [§128] Civil Cases.

F. [§129] Knowledge.

G. [§130] Insanity and Incompetency.

H. Identity of Person.

1. [§131] Fingerprints and Palmprints.
2. [§132] Footprints.
3. [§133] Telephone Call.
4. [§134] Defendant's Possession of Stolen Articles.
5. [§135] Other Circumstances.

I. [§136] Ownership.

IV. EVIDENCE INVOLVING UNDUE PREJUDICE

A. [§137] In General.

B. Insurance or No Insurance.

1. [§138] General Rule: Evidence of Insurance Is Excluded.
2. [§139] Admissible Evidence.
3. [§140] Permissible Reference.
4. [§141] Weighing Relevancy and Prejudicial Effect.
5. [§142] Plaintiff's Accident Insurance.

C. [§143] Poverty of Plaintiff.

D. [§144] Wealth.

E. Offer To Settle or Compromise.

1. [§145] Rule and Theory of Exclusion.
2. [§146] Rule Applies in Discovery Proceeding.
3. Scope of Rule.
 - (a) [§147] In General.
 - (b) [§148] Conduct or Statements in Negotiation.
4. Exceptions and Distinctions.
 - (a) [§149] Evidence Code Exceptions.
 - (b) [§150] Independent Negotiations or Statements.
 - (c) [§151] Statements Showing Good Faith.
 - (d) [§152] Statements Showing Bad Motive.
 - (e) [§153] Miscellaneous Exceptions.

F. [§154] Offer To Discount Claim.

G. Defendant's Settlement With Another Person.

1. [§155] General Rule.
2. [§156] Distinction: Reduction of Judgment.

H. Information Disclosed in Mediation Proceeding.

1. [§157] Purpose and Nature of Protection.
2. [§158] Scope of Protection and Remedies for Violations.
3. [§159] Judicial Exceptions Rejected.
4. [§160] Proceedings Covered.
5. [§161] Exceptions and Distinctions.
6. [§162] Termination of Mediation.
7. [§163] No Disqualification of Mediation Attorney From Related Case.

8. [§164] Nonstatutory Protection.

I. [§165] Other Claims or Litigation by Plaintiff.

J. Compensation to Plaintiff From Collateral Source.

1. [§166] General Rule.

2. [§167] Attempts To Circumvent Rule.

3. [§168] Distinction: Plaintiff's Own Payments.

K. [§169] Wrongful Death: Spouse's Remarriage.

L. Subsequent Precautions or Repairs by Defendant.

1. Negligence Cases.

(a) [§170] Rule and Theory of Exclusion.

(b) [§171] Limited Admissibility Exception.

2. Strict Products Liability Actions.

(a) [§172] General Rule of Admissibility.

(b) [§173] Failure To Make Changes.

(c) [§174] Subsequent Warning.

(d) [§175] Remedial Measure by Nonparty.